

Exhibit "19"

1 here. There were no account -- Grande was not terminating
2 subscribers prior to 2017. It began in 2017.

3 That's all I have, your Honor.

4 THE COURT: Thank you.

5 I'm prepared to rule on this from the bench and
6 so, I'll state my ruling on the record and I'll follow up
7 with a written order memorializing it.

8 But after reviewing -- you know, hearing the
9 argument, reviewing the record -- I mean, sorry, the
10 motion and the response and the reply and then, I'm
11 hearing argument on the hearing here today, I'm reviewing
12 the requests themselves, and really, what this motion's
13 directed at is three specific RFPs that were attached as
14 -- or on the docket as 68-2, RFPs No. 3, 4 and 5. In my
15 view, these are just untethered to any suggested relevant
16 timeframe in that I -- ultimately, I agree with defendants
17 that they're too broad. Given plaintiffs' counsel an
18 opportunity to suggest a cutoff or a relevant timeframe
19 and the RFPs themselves just basically adopt the universe
20 of documents from the UMG case, that's a different case,
21 different facts. I agree with defendants about that.

22 And so, therefore, I'm denying the motion to
23 compel. If -- I don't necessarily -- you know, in denying
24 that motion to compel, I don't disagree that there might
25 be some realm of documents that are discoverable beyond

1 the suggested timeline of defendants, but I agree that as
2 these are worded, it's too broad and goes far too far and
3 that a more targeted discovery request either identifying
4 a timeline that has some basis in the facts alleged in
5 this case or particular subscribers, if there are
6 particular subscribers who are alleged to have infringed,
7 those sort of targeted discovery requests I think would be
8 appropriate. But without any sort of bracketing of the
9 requests as they appear here, I'm not going to grant that
10 motion nor am I going to rewrite it for plaintiff.

11 So I'm denying the motion. As I said, I'll issue
12 a written order to that effect. And if there's not
13 anything else for us to address while we're all here
14 together, Mr. Culpepper.

15 MR. CULPEPPER: I have nothing further, your
16 Honor.

17 MR. HOWENSTINE: No, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: All right. Then you are excused.
19 Safe travels home.

20 MR. HOWENSTINE: Thank you.

21 (Proceedings conclude at 2:23 p.m.)
22
23
24
25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I, LILY I. REZNIK, DO HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING
 WAS TRANSCRIBED FROM AN ELECTRONIC RECORDING MADE AT THE
 TIME OF THE AFORESAID PROCEEDINGS AND IS A CORRECT
 TRANSCRIPT, TO THE BEST OF MY ABILITY, MADE FROM THE
 PROCEEDINGS IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED MATTER, AND THAT THE
 TRANSCRIPT FEES AND FORMAT COMPLY WITH THOSE PRESCRIBED BY
 THE COURT AND JUDICIAL CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES,
 ON THIS 24th DAY OF APRIL, 2023.

Lily Iva Reznik

~~~~~  
 LILY I. REZNIK CRR RMR  
 Official Court Reporter  
 United States District Court  
 Austin Division  
 501 West 5th Street, Suite 4153  
 Austin, Texas 78701  
 (512) 391-8792  
 SOT Certification No. 4481  
 Expires: 1-31-25